diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc

Posted by KenBuzbee - 31 Aug 2012 16:24

Okay, I know this has been discussed in bits here and there but can anyone generalize the differences in the edge obtained from the various materials? For this discussion, I'm talking about at the same basic grit. Say, all at 1000...

I know (well, I think I know;)) some of this but a general comparison would be helpful, both in what the edge looks like and how it performs in various scenarios.

Like you can get an 800 grit diamond plate and an 800 grit Naniwa Super, why would you choose one over the other?

Now I "think" the 800 grit diamond plate will cut faster but leave deeper scratch lines for the next progression to deal with (true or not true?)

Related to this, I've frequently read that if you plan to use a Naniwa for your finishing stone you should use it for the 2-3 prior grits too so you have fewer deeper scratches to deal with (true or not true?) If true, same for Chosera/Shaptons etc?

And where do the ceramic stones fit into all this? Scratches deeper than a Naniwa Super but shallower than a diamond plate?

Now I know the final results are what YOU want in your edge and ultimately only you can find the progression that works for you but some theory on what should be expected is a good thing to have.

Lastly, if ALL this has been beat to death in a thread I've missed, please post a link!

Thanks to all!

Ken

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc
Posted by cbwx34 - 02 Sep 2012 09:35

---

jendeindustries wrote:

Technique plays a huge role in those results as well.

I think it's the most important factor, even on a guided system.

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc
Posted by cbwx34 - 02 Sep 2012 09:53

PhilipPasteur wrote:

I may just try to find that book... sounds like a good read!

Here's a link to that book I mentioned...

www.amazon.com/The-Art-Japanese-Sword-Po...770024940/ref=sr_1_1

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc
Posted by KenBuzbee - 02 Sep 2012 10:11

PhilipPasteur wrote:

Here is another

www.wickededgeusa.com/index.php?option=c...d=1824&Itemid=63

Some great threads, especially this last one contained some good omparisons. Thanks!

I feel the seeds of obsession starting;)

Related question... How does the "smoothness" of the edge impact durability?

Ken

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc

Posted by KenBuzbee - 02 Sep 2012 11:41

_____

jendeindustries wrote:

However, if you were looking for more robustness, you could simply get a knife plenty sharp by making large jumps that "polish the grooves"

Please define "robustness"

cbwx34 wrote:

jendeindustries wrote:

Technique plays a huge role in those results as well.

I think it's the most important factor, even on a guided system.

That makes perfect sense as a lighter touch, even with diamonds, will yield scratches that are shallower....

Ken

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc

Posted by PhilipPasteur - 02 Sep 2012 12:29

_____

[quote="KenBuzbee"

I feel the seeds of obsession starting;)

Related question... How does the "smoothness" of the edge impact durability?

Ken[/quote]

That is one I will leave for somebody like perhaps BassLakeDan to cover.

I can say that you can read opinions on this that run the gamut. For a long time it seemed to me that most people were saying that a smooth (non-toothy) edge would be more durable. Recently I have read of sharpening gurus claiming the opposite. In any case it still seems like it would be related to what the knife is being used for and the steel it is made from and the angle you are shapening at. Besides that, without a reliable means of measuring sharpness the answer becomes more of an opinion than a fact. This is why I mention Dan, he has this. I don't have any reliable and repeatable method of measuring sharpness, so I can't answer this question quantitatively.

In the end it becomes pretty simple though, you sharpen the blade for a given task, then resharpen it when it gets dull. In general, if you pick the right steel for what you want to do and sharpen properly, you will get the longest period between required sharpening.

Phil

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc

Posted by KenBuzbee - 02 Sep 2012 13:41

PhilipPasteur wrote:

For a long time it seemed to me that most people were saying that a smooth (non-toothy) edge would be more durable. Recently I have read of sharpening gurus claiming the opposite.

Exactly, I've been reading the same shift. In my mind, it seems as though teeth would round off more quickly, but there may be other factors that come into play.

PhilipPasteur wrote:

In the end it becomes pretty simple though, you sharpen the blade for a given task, then resharpen it when it gets dull. In general, if you pick the right steel for what you want to do and sharpen properly, you will get the longest period between required sharpening.

Ultimately, this is right but it seems like there would be general trending that applies to 60% 70% 80% of EDC tasks.... If only for each steel, like S90V or CPM M4 (generally considered good edge holders).

You hit on a key point that sharpness, even if quantitatively measured is subjective as to the type of edge desired. Still, it's interesting to hear people's experiences.

Ken

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc

Posted by PhilipPasteur - 02 Sep 2012 17:45

[quote="KenBuzbee" post=5114

Ultimately, this is right but it seems like there would be general trending that applies to 60% 70% 80% of EDC tasks.... If only for each steel, like S90V or CPM M4 (generally considered good edge holders).

Ken[/quote]

How would you propose that anyone would get the raw numbers to calculate those percentages?

Way too many variables and no hard data. The steels that you list are fairly rare, making data even more scarce. My EDC tasks are undoubtedly different than yours. A buddy of mine cuts wire and strips insulation quite frequently, another cuts up old carpet most every day ... Probably the best you can hope to get is someone's opinion based upon what they have seen and what they do with their blades.

IMHO

Phil

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc
Posted by jendeindustries - 02 Sep 2012 18:33

Here's where we begin to search deeper into the rabbit hole

Before I define "Robustness", it would be better to answer about the smoothness of an edge and its impact on durability.

As with all things sharpening, it depends. Smoothness is only one of several factors that will determine the outcome to whether or not a smoother edge lasts longer. Geometry plays one of the largest roles, as well as the steel characteristics.

That's all I can say for now - I will be back in a few hours to further answer!

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc
Posted by PhilipPasteur - 02 Sep 2012 18:51

Now things will get interesting (in a few hours) !!

This is one of those opinions based upon experience that is worth listening to!

That damn rabbit hole...

Phil

==========

Re: diamond vs naniwa super vs ceramic vs shapton etc
Posted by KenBuzbee - 02 Sep 2012 21:23

PhilipPasteur wrote:

How would you propose that anyone would get the raw numbers to calculate those percentages?

Sorry for being unclear, Phil. I was attempting to say an unknown percentage of typical EDC use could be accounted for in one grouping. Whether that is 60% 80% whatever!

But your point is that it would be anecdotal at best? Probably so.

Ken - waiting for the rabbit hole

==========